MOINUDDIN M. SYED

Educational Reform in the Federally Administered Tribal Area (FATA) of Pakistan: A Strategy for Moderation and Stability

Department of Political Science

(April 12, 2010)
MOINUDDIN M. SYED

Educational Reform in the Federally Administered Tribal Area (FATA) of Pakistan: A Strategy for Moderation and Stability

Submitted to the Department of Political Science of Allegheny College in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Bachelor of Arts.

I hereby recognize and pledge to fulfill my responsibilities as defined in the Honor Code and to maintain the integrity of both myself and the College community as a whole.

______________________________ (NAME PRINTED HERE)

______________________________ (HONOR CODE SIGNATURE)

Approved by:

______________________________ (Michael Maniates)

______________________________ (Sharon Wesoky)
The ink of the scholar is more holy than the blood of the martyr

-Prophet Mohammed (PBUH)
Acknowledgments

To my friends and brothers: Thank you for all your support and encouragement. I cannot name all of you but you all have a special place and role in my life.

To my parents: I am grateful to you for prioritizing my education and making sure that I am able to take advantage of all the opportunities that come my way. I would like to devote this senior project to your efforts and sacrifices.

Usman & Mahwish: I am glad that you two are a part of my life. While we may not be as close as I would like, I love you both.

Ines: Thanks for being there and helping me through some challenging times.

Brett: Thanks for being a great friend. I cherish our friendship. These past 4 years wouldn’t have been the same without you.

Professor Maniates: Thank you for your willingness to help me despite your hectic schedule. Our conversations and meetings helped me stay sane throughout this process.

Professor Wesoky: I appreciate your help in regards to some of the preliminary material you provided to help me begin the process. Your role as an academic advisor has been invaluable through our varied conversations in your office and around campus. My only regret is not actively seeking your advice during this process.
Introduction

Education as a Tool For Moderation and Stability

Extremism and terrorism pose a serious and growing risk to global security. Security is only the superficial element at stake but in the long run, extremism and terrorism restrict progress, especially in the developing world. The US led “global war on terror” has exposed the depth and expanse of extremism throughout the world. The report filed by the International Workshop on Global Extremism, Terror and Response Strategies articulated that while extremism and terrorism are not necessarily interchangeable, but if “not carefully monitored, extremism can be easily transformed into terrorism (Kholy, 2006, p. 11).” This means that extremism and terrorism, while not interchangeable, have a strong correlation. According to the findings of the workshop, this makes it a critical challenge for nations, especially developing ones, to actively confront the threat posed by extremism.

Extremism and consequently terrorism can be effectively dismantled if their root causes are eliminated. A simple approach would be that there should be a comprehensive effort to stamp out extremism in areas where there is a high potential or possibility of it being transformed into terrorism. However, the implementation of this broad strategy is where the issue gets complicated. An environment of extremism can be addressed by promoting by a variety of interventions. These interventions can be either military or nono-military. There is a growing convergence amongst experts that extremism is best addressed through non-military strategies that eliminate it at the grassroots. Such strategies center on promoting moderation and enhancing stability in areas where
rampant extremism exists. In this regard, extremism must be viewed through the lens of history, politics, and socioeconomics. An effective strategy to promote moderation and stability must be tailored to the particular environment and as such require an in-depth understanding of why that particular environment is susceptible to extremism.

Pakistan, a nation comprised of a variety of ethnic and linguistic groups with a fledgling democracy, is one the most vulnerable places for the transformation of extremism into terrorism. This reality along with Pakistan’s status as a frontline state in the US led “global war on terror” makes it an interesting case study with respect to developing effective strategies to combat extremism (Abbas, 2005). Since the invasion of Afghanistan, Pakistan has made its away up into the international spotlight as a crucial battleground between the United States and various terrorists and extremist organizations, mainly Al-Qaeda and the Taliban (Abbas, 2005). The history, political culture, and the overall socioeconomic environment in the country make any efforts to create a moderate civil environment difficult. This is in part due to the instability associated with its government and its struggle to establish its authority (Abbas, 2005). The political history of Pakistan has been dominated by military dictatorships. This dominance of military rulers over elected ones has undermined the development of any significant democratic tradition (Jones, 2002). This absence of stable governance is one of the major reasons behind the prevalence of power vacuums throughout the country. This is especially true in the western and primarily tribal areas of Pakistan (Nawaz, 2009). A part of this tribal landscape includes a region called the Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA) that function as a group of semi-autonomous administrative units and agencies (Khan, 2008). This is further complicated by the fact that this area situated right at the border between
Pakistan and Afghanistan. In this expanse of land, the existing power vacuums have been infiltrated by extremist actors, mainly the Taliban and Al-Qaeda, that often end up becoming agents of terror for the area and the region at large (Nawaz, 2009).

The border region, parts of which include the Federally Administered Tribal Areas, “is a forbidding landscape of towering mountain ranges, narrow valleys, desert plains, and rocky, barren wasteland (Johnson & Mason, 2008, p. 43).” The terrain of the FATA itself is one of the most complicating aspects that make it vulnerable to extremist elements that often use terror as a primary tactic. Due to the natural inaccessibility afforded by the landscape, the Taliban and Al-Qaeda, “since retreating from Afghanistan following the US invasion in October 2001, have found sanctuary” in the area (Johnson, & Mason, 2008, p. 42). The Taliban and other radical groups have exploited the existing power vacuums in these areas to establish their authority to create new breeding grounds for their extremist ideologies via the madrassah network (Warren, 2009). Furthermore, military campaigns to root out these elements have been unsuccessful. Instead these campaigns have provided a sense of legitimacy to the presence of these extremist actors. All this begs the question, what can be done to restrict this uncontrollable spread of terrorism via the presence of extremism elements in Pakistan, especially in the tribal areas? Before attempting to answer this question, the situation must be viewed in all its dimensions. Much of the problem lies in the negligence that has been prevalent throughout Pakistan’s history with respect to its tribal areas. This has been exacerbated by the poor economic situation and repressive governance infrastructure in Pakistan, especially in FATA (Nawaz, 2009). Despite all these issues, the situation in Pakistan and
specifically in FATA is an opportunity to develop and implement strategies to combat extremism that go beyond just military operations.

One particular strategy that has the potential to create a moderate civil environment is developing a viable educational infrastructure. As Nicholas D. Kristof states in a New York Times op-ed, More Schools, Not Troops, “evidence suggests that education can help foster a virtuous cycle that promotes stability and moderation.” In addition, looking at the work that activists like Greg Mortensen have done in other areas of western Pakistan as well as Afghanistan, there is proof that education has the potential to transform communities in unexpected and positive ways. With this in mind, the central question that will be the guiding force behind my research is how can education be used as tool to promote moderation and stability in Pakistan’s Federally Administered Tribal Areas? FATA is “one of the poorest and most disenfranchised regions of Pakistan (Nawaz, 2009, p. 7).” FATA is extremely unstable and a very underdeveloped area, even by the most conservative development standards (Nawaz, 2009). This along with the increasing power of extremist actors demands that Pakistan invests in FATA, especially in terms of developing a sustainable educational infrastructure.

Chapter 1 of this project provides background information on the Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA) of Pakistan and why these areas need to be a priority for development. The chapter covers the geography, history, socioeconomics, the civil environment, and what efforts are underway in terms of development. It also provides a general sense of the role of madrassahs in promoting extremism in FATA. All these different factors offer insights into why extremism has found fertile ground in the
area. This insight is important within the context of determining what possible interventions can be effective in curbing extremism in these areas.

Chapter 2 focuses on possible interventions or strategies that can be used to promote moderation and stability in general. This chapter gives a general overview of the suggested interventions to confront the growth of extremism and terrorism by experts and policy analysts. By providing a general idea of the strategies for moderation, this chapter provides a context to why education could possibly be a foundational element to peace and stability.

Chapter 3 discusses education as a tool for moderation and stability. This chapter looks at ways in which education may be used to create an environment that deters extremism and consequently terrorism. It explores ways in which education can provide the foundation for poverty alleviation, social stability, and overall development. This chapter provides the framework for possible elements of a sustainable educational infrastructure in FATA.

Chapter 4 analyzes the information discussed in Chapters 1 through 3. It provides the answer to the central question of this project, *how can education be used as a tool to promote moderation and stability in FATA?* The chapter utilizes the information in Chapter 3 and concludes if those strategies are practical for FATA with respect to what is known about the area. Ultimately, this senior project provides a recommendation of what should be the focus of development efforts in FATA.
Chapter 1

Pakistan’s Tribal Areas: The Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA)

Pakistan’s tribal areas serve as the battlegrounds for US-led global war on terror. Due to its geographical location and overall socio-economic environment, this specific region is particularly vulnerable to elements of extremism and violence. In many instances, it has served as a base to plan and launch attacks in Pakistan and around the region (Nawaz, 2009). These factors alone make the Federally Administered Tribal Areas or FATA an interesting case study for experimenting with strategies that can be successful in combating extremism, creating a moderate civil environment, and fostering stability. What is important is to realize is that there are a variety of complex issues that impede any strategy geared towards providing stability for these areas. In order to be aware of these complex issues, an understanding of the overall political, ethnic, geographical, and socio-economical environment of FATA is essential grasping its position as critical frontline in the war against terror.

This chapter will focus on giving a general overview of FATA and why it has become such an attractive location for extremists. This chapter has two sections. The first section describes FATA and what is going on the areas. It has information on the geography, history, socio-economics, and the rising violence in the areas. The second section is on the madrassahs and their role in fueling extremism and violence.
FATA and the Roots of Extremism

The Federally Administered Tribal Areas or commonly referred to as FATA are located in western Pakistan along the country's border with Afghanistan and comprised of seven semi-autonomous agencies or administrative units and six tribal agencies (International Crisis Group [ICG], 2009). It “covers more than 10,000 square miles of rugged landscape that sweeps down western Pakistan (Northam, 2009, p. 1).” This “rugged landscape” includes “towering mountain ranges, narrow valleys, desert plains, and rocky barren wasteland (Johnson & Mason, 2008, p. 43).” The nature of the landscape is relevant because it helps in understanding why these areas are difficult to control. The physical layout makes centralized governance difficult. Therefore, the Pakistani government has a more decentralized system of governance in place in FATA (ICG, 2009). This policy of decentralization has resulted in serious security implications for Pakistan and the region at large.

The Durand Line is an important element of what shapes FATA and the geo-strategic border it shares with Afghanistan. The line “was negotiated and formalized in 1893 (Johnson & Mason 2008, p.67).” It was proposed by a group of British surveyors that was headed by Sir Mortimer Durand (Johnson & Mason 2008, p. 67). The purpose of the line was to formally distinguish British controlled territory from Afghanistan (Johnson & Mason, 2008). The Durand Line, in keeping with the “contours of convenient geographical features” ended up dividing the “Pashtun nation” basically in half (Johnson & Mason, 2008, p. 67). Presently, this line separates Pakistani territories from Afghanistan while at the same time keeping the “Pashtun nation” divided between the
two countries (Johnson & Mason, 2008). The Durand Line has never been accepted as being legitimate by majority of the Pashtun tribes (Johnson & Mason, 2008). For the Pahstun of Pakistan and Afghanistan, the border is inconsequential.

The ethnic and religious composition of FATA explains why the area has become such an attractive target for extremist agents. Ethnically, FATA is mainly comprised of the Pashtun tribes. According to the demographic data available, about “13 million Pashtuns live on the Pakistani side of the border and comparable number live in Afghanistan (Northam, 2009, p.1).” Of the 13 million Pashtuns in Pakistan, about 3.2 to 4.0 million live in FATA (Johnson & Mason, 2008). This intimate connection between western Pakistan and Afghanistan has resulted in an extremely “porous” border that has created serious security concerns for both nations in their attempts to address the rampant extremism (Bajoria, 2009). The terrain of the region has only helped this permeability in general. This is an extremely important consideration when it comes to formulating an effective strategy for the area. There are, however, other ethnic groups that also reside in FATA “each of who speaks a distinct language (Johnson & Mason, 2008, p. 47).”

Religiously, most of these ethnic groups practice Islam and belong to the Sunni denomination. However, there is a “tiny majority of Pashtuns [that] are Shiites, principally clustered in the Kurram river valley in Kurram Agency of the FATA (Johnson & Mason, 2008, p. 47).” The ethnic and religious composition of FATA is critical to understanding why the Taliban and other similar extremists found shelter there. “The ousted Taliban leaders portray themselves as representatives of the Pashtuns, fighting to take back their country from an occupying force of the United States and other foreigners and against, in their view, an unrepresentative government in Kabul that is dominated by
non-Pashtuns (Nawaz, 2009, p. 6).” The ethnic and religious identities provide a channel through which these extremists groups are able to set up a stronghold. Furthermore, by promoting a mutual threat, extremists groups like the Taliban and Al-Qaeda have found a way to merge their interests with that of the tribes of FATA. This “perception” of aligning interests is a strong element of their recruitment campaign as well (Nawaz, 2009, p. 6). Nawaz (2009) uses a description by Shahid Javed Burki, a Pakistani economist, to summarize the dynamics of FATA:

[The] Pashtun belt that Afghanistan and Pakistan share presents a unique problem to the international community. It straddles a difficult, inhospitable, extremely underdeveloped terrain. It is inhabited by people who preferred to be guided by a tribal code of behavior [Pashtunwali] rather than the laws made by modern states for modern times. To this code that had existed even before Islam entered the area, they have added some aspects of the Islamic law, Sharia. The combination of these two codes has produced a way of life that has been practiced for centuries. Among its many features the strongest are an abhorrence to accept outside interference in internal affairs, an equal amount of reluctance to be governed by a central authority that operates from a distant place, and confidence in the ability of local leaders to provide protection to their communities and to provide an environment in which they can live according to their own laws and practices (p. 6).

Understanding the dynamics of Pashtun society helps in providing a sense of why it can be difficult prospect to create any form of lasting stability. Strategies that intend to promote stability and moderation must take into consideration the nature of Pashtun society. As described by Burki, the Pashtun culture is an extremely independent one and therefore there should be a focus on involving them as equal partners as part of any effort to confront extremism and terrorism in these areas, instead of alienating them or framing them as part of the problem.
As described by Burki, the Pashtun tribes in FATA strictly observe *Pashtunwali*, the Pashtun social code. According to Johnson & Mason (2008), Pashtunwali is “a set of values and unwritten, but universally understood, precepts that define Pashtun culture (p. 59).” Its literal translation means “the way of the Pashtun (Johnson & Mason, 2008, p.59).” It is the essence of the cultural and social fabric of Pashtun society because it “shapes all forms of behavior from the cradle to the grave (Johnson & Mason, 2008, p. 59).” It is the most fundamental criterion for honor in Pashtun society. According to Johnson & Mason (2008), “a closed interdependent” people like Pashtun, having no honor leads to social excommunication (p. 59). In the basic sense, Pashtunwali is an intricate community agreement (Johnson & Mason, 2008). As with any social code, it is a collection of certain obligations and expectations. These obligations and expectations are the foundation of Pashtun identity. This social code is intrinsically part of the internal legal code of Pashtun society. All members of the Pashtun nation universally accept its rules and punishments. The *jirga* serves as the final process where all the issues, conflicts, and crimes are addressed (Johnson & Mason, 2008). However, it is important to understand the jirga as a process and not as an event or single meeting. The jirga is an investigation by the most credible members of Pashtun society, usually the elders who determine the merits of a particular case or situation (Johnson & Mason 2008).

Pashtunwali “is neither the absence of governance, nor summary judgment, nor a lynch mob at work. Rather, it is an alternative form of social organization with an advanced conflict resolution mechanism that does not involve [any traditional legal element] (Johnson & Mason, 2008, p. 61).” The importance of this social code to the Pashtun must

---

1 Council of Pashtun elders
not be ignored with respect to any policy for development.

The colonial history of FATA provides interesting insights into the fragile governance system that exists today. The British annexed these tribal areas that comprise FATA in 1848 (Haider, 2009, p. 4). The major purpose behind the annexation of these areas was so that they could serve as buffer against “Russia’s great game machinations in Afghanistan and from tribal raids” on the empire’s more critical areas (Haider, 2009, p. 4). However, even during British control, the tribes were given “autonomy in their affairs (Haider, 2009, p. 4).” Despite this, the British faced multiple challenges to their control of the area from the tribes (Haider, 2009). In 1947, with the establishment of Pakistan, the tribes acceded to the newly formed state with the explicit guarantee by Muhammad Ali Jinnah, the leader of the independence movement, that they would still be left alone to decide their own affairs (Haider, 2009). This attitude led to the Pakistani government creating a loose governance mechanism that basically neglected the region for majority of time between 1948-1971 (Khan, 2008). This policy led to the preservation of the “colonial system [that] was characterized by minimum state penetration and aimed at only ensuring security for roads and government posts (Khan, 2008, p. 16).” The perpetuation of a decentralized approach towards FATA maintained the status quo but ultimately ensured a weak system of governance.

Administratively, these tribal areas are grouped together and seen as a single administrative entity by the government of Pakistan. However, each of the seven districts and 6 tribal agencies “has its special tribal, geographic, socioeconomic, and religious characteristics (Nawaz, 2009, p.13).” Due to the geographic link that FATA has with the federal province of NWFP (North West Frontier Province), the governor of the NWFP
has administrative control over FATA (Khan, 2008, p. 15). However, each of the administrative districts, "which are known as political agencies" is also administered by a "political agent (PA) (Khan, 2008, p. 15)." The PA serves as the chief executive, judicial, and administrative officer for his respective agency (Khan, 2008, p. 15) "His authority is mainly derived from his command of "tribal and irregular forces" and working with elders of the various tribes to reach consensus on various issues (Haider, 2009, p. 5). This is just one of the three mechanisms of governance system in place today in FATA. These three “pillars” that form the governance system in FATA are important in understanding why FATA is such a vacuum of power (Haider, 2009). The PA exercises significant authority over the areas and is largely seen as an agent of repression (ICG, 2009). This has generated serious mistrust towards government entities by the people of FATA.

The second element, the maliki system, forms the next “pillar” of the governance system in FATA (Haider, 2009). Basically, this system revolves around tribal elders who share a mutually beneficial relationship with the government. By virtue of this relationship, they receive the title, *malik* and “receive hereditary subsidies or *mujawibs* and special status with additional privileges (Haider, 2009, p.5).” These elders or *maliks* ensure stability through their membership in their respective jirga (Haider, 2009). Their elevated status within their tribes ensures the legitimacy of the decisions they make and they make sure that they take into account the interests of the government when making those decisions. By providing them with an incentive such as the *mujawibs*, the British and now the Pakistani government ensured that they would not act against the government (Haider, 2009). By institutionalizing the tribal justice system, the status quo was preserved. Maintaining this status quo was part of a larger policy of ensuring some
type of order in this arduous terrain. However, this policy has come at a great cost in terms of its contribution to creating power vacuums that allowed internal and external extremist and radical actors to establish a stronghold.

The third “pillar” of FATA governance is rooted in Frontier Crimes Regulations (FCR) (Haider, 2009). The first FCR was introduced in 1871 with the present regulation tracing its inception to 1901 (Haider, 2009). The FCR was aimed at incorporating local governance systems, such as the Pashtunwali, into a single legal code (Khan, 2008). The FCR however is restricted to only address crimes against the government. These regulations provide the Political Agent (PA) with discretionary powers to punish individuals for crimes without any “due process or right of appeal (Zissis & Bajoria, 2007).” This creates a governance system in these areas where the PA is a de-facto “ruler.” These three elements that form the governance system in FATA are important in understanding why FATA is such a vacuum of power.

The official governance structure in place in FATA is extremely fragile in terms of its viability and enforceability. By creating parallel codes, the authorities have created an extremely complex political and legal situation. Furthermore, The “semi-autonomous” nature of these areas has resulted in a “regressive and receding governance system” as well as making it an ideal shelter for terrorists and extremists (Haider, 2009, p. 2). This had made it easier for the Taliban and Al Qaeda to “gain strength and launch attacks in and beyond South Asia (Haider, 2009, p. 1).” The lack of any centralized authority should be seen as the major problem in FATA. Appeasing the various interest groups has created chaos with respect to governance, therefore making it difficult to establish any
sense of law and order. It will require reconciling century old customs, decades of “regressive governance,” and any lack of any overall sense of nationalism to overcome the chaos present in FATA (Haider, 2009). This reconciliation requires an active partnership between the federal government and the people of FATA. Without giving the people a voice, any form of governance will be viewed suspiciously. This aspect must be considered in order for the governance system to be viable and enforceable.

The tribal areas formal relationship to the rest of Pakistan presents another obstacle to any process of development. At the national level, FATA does not actively participate in the political system of Pakistan (Nawaz, 2009). Instead of using free elections to pick the FATA representatives for Pakistan’s national assembly, it is the tribal maliks who decide who they will be. It wasn’t until 1997 that “universal franchise” was incorporated in FATA (Nawaz, 2009). As previously mentioned, due to the geographic link FATA shares with the NWFP, its administrative governance falls under NWFP government. Despite this, FATA does not have representation in the provincial assembly of NWFP (Nawaz, 2009). Since FATA is not a federal province but just an area that is federally administered, “the Pakistan Political Parties Act does not apply to FATA and officially political parties cannot operate or campaign inside its boundaries (Nawaz, 2009, p. 8).” This rule has given room for religious organizations, especially extremist ones, free reign to operate in area (Nawaz, 2009). All these factors have contributed to FATA and its people’s sense of “deprivation of rights and alienation from Pakistan proper (Nawaz, 2009, p. 9).” The treatment of the local population as a “bastard child” has contributed to a sense of resentment that will need to be addressed as part of the process of development.
The socio-economic environment in FATA is another contributing factor to the ability of extremist organizations to form a stronghold in this area. The economy is extremely weak and there isn’t much opportunity available. “It is one of the poorest and most disenfranchised regions of Pakistan (Nawaz, 2009, p.7).” Comprehensive development of these areas for the most part remains stagnant (Nawaz, 2009). This reality has much to do with the fact that these areas primarily were left without assistance by the Pakistani government after they acceded to the new state. By preserving the colonial administrative system in the wake of independence in 1947, these areas remained, for the most part, out of any national policy for development (Nawaz, 2009). Pakistan itself faced and continues to experience acute development deficiencies so any support towards FATA was increasingly rare for greater part of the last 6 decades. While there was a limited push by Zulfikar Ali Bhutto in the 1970s to promote development in FATA with new policies, they did not go far enough to address the deficiencies (Khan, 2008). The consistent historical negligence and inadequate policies towards development of FATA has made it an easy target for extremist actors.

A look at selected development indicators for FATA in comparison to the rest of Pakistan provides insights into of why FATA might be such a breeding ground for extremism and violence. These statistics are yet another sign of the fragile situation in FATA and why it should be viewed as a development priority. At the most fundamental level, FATA lacks any socio-economic infrastructure that might provide stability and foster a moderate civil environment in FATA (FATA Civil Secretariat [CS], 2009). The economy is “based on agriculture and the subsistence-level use of natural resources (FATA [CS], 2009, p. 5).” The FATA Development Authority, which was established in...
2006, lists a series of projects on its website that are designed to build infrastructure. However with the recent global economic crisis it is unlikely that these projects will come to fruition in the near future. This situation is further exacerbated by the presence of extremist actors that make it difficult to sustain development efforts

The literacy rate is a witness to the largely non-existent and abysmal educational infrastructure in FATA. The lack of a formal educational infrastructure presents many implications (Haider, 2009). About 17 percent of the population is literate and that figure drops to about 3 percent for the women in the area (FATA [CS], 2009). The major factors contributing to the inability for people in FATA to obtain an education are poverty, the anticipated opportunity cost of attending schools, and accessibility with respect to location (FATA [CS], 2009). These are the primary issues that need to be addressed in order to create a viable infrastructure for education in FATA. Without an educated populace, FATA will never be able to attain a rate of growth it requires to come out of the circumstances that currently envelopes the area. The strikingly low levels of literacy, both for men and women but especially women, should be a cause for alarm. Education, a millennium development goal, is a goal for a reason. The longer FATA lags behind in terms of having an education, the easier it will be for extremists to maintain a stronghold in the area via their network of madrassahs.

This fragile governance system and socio-economic infrastructure has made it easier for extremists and terrorists to find shelter in FATA. “Most of the Taliban leadership in Afghanistan and followers of at least two major mujahideen’ commanders

2 Arabic word for “Freedom fighter”
of the Afghan war against Soviet occupation during the 1980s are believed to have taken refuge among their fellow tribesmen, where they continue to prosecute their war against the United States and the new Afghan government (Nawaz, 2009, p.7).” The presence of these individuals contributes to the rising violence and militancy (Warren, 2009). Furthermore, “elements of al Qaeda, the global terrorist conglomerate, continue to use FATA as a base and training ground for al Qaeda and its franchisees (Nawaz, 2009, p.7).” According to some accounts, the Taliban and al Qaeda have formed “an effective military alliance of convenience (Nawaz, 2009, p.7).” By any measure, this situation should be a cause for grave concern. Their ability to thrive in FATA should make these areas a top priority for counter extremism efforts. It will require a protracted development effort to dismantle them and restrict their influence.

**Madrassahs**

One of the strongest cornerstones of the extremist movement in FATA is the network of madrassahs they use for training and indoctrinating the next generation of recruits. Madrassahs or religious schools in Pakistan were developed as part of system to educate future Islamic scholars and clerics (Looney, 2003). There are still madrassahs that are true to their original mission and provide a quality education. However, some of these madrassahs began to serve another purpose, especially those located along the border region of Pakistan and Afghanistan (Warren, 2009). These madrassahs were utilized for the “particular purpose of fighting against the Soviet Union (Warren, 2009, p. 5).” Soon these madrassahs developed a strong association “with militancy” as part of this effort (Warren, 2009, p.5). These madrassahs also served as the starting point of the
Taliban movement during the early 1990s (Warren, 2009). These madrassahs provided a distinct Islamist ideology to the Taliban, completely independent of their own tribal and Pashtun cultural traditions (Warren, 2009). In the aftermath of the Taliban retreat from Afghanistan during the US-led invasion in 2001, these madrassahs along the border region have “provided safe havens” for them (Warren, 2009, p.7). By reconnecting to their roots, the Taliban have gained a strong influence in these areas and have adapted the network of madrassahs as part of their overall strategy of insurgency (Warren, 2009). As recently as 2008, there were approximately 12,000 madrassahs in Pakistan with an estimated student population of 1.7 to 1.9 million (Warren, 2009). According to various estimates, at least “15 percent of these madrassas have some type” of Taliban connection (Warren, 2009, p.7). This means that they have sizable number of potential recruits still in the “pipeline (Warren, 2009).” Without addressing this network of madrassahs that is being exploited by extremists, the root causes of instability will go unaddressed. An effective counter-strategy needs to actively confront this challenge.

The appeal of madrassahs lies in the level of accessibility they offer. Pakistan’s “public school system is in shambles,” especially in the rural areas of the country (Looney, 2003, p. 261). Madrassahs “offer an attractive alternative: free education, free meals, free schoolbooks and even in some cases a stipend (Looney, 2003, p. 261).” Given the socio-economic environment in FATA, madrassahs have a strong appeal and one that many families in the area would be irrational to pass over. The flip side of this issue is that these madrassahs strict and fundamentalist religious curriculum provides a pathway to extremist indoctrination, especially for young children. These madrassahs have become notorious as “factories of jihad (Andrabi, Khwaja, & Zajonc, 2006, p.2).” The
mission of these madrassahs and the accessibility they afford to the poor must be considered when formulating a counterstrategy to curb the growth extremism in these areas. As long as these madrassahs can offer such benefits, it would be hard to effectively eliminate their influence in a vulnerable area like FATA.

One of the most troubling aspects these types of madrassahs is the curriculum. The course of study offered at these madrassahs is largely “non-technical [and] non-scientific (Looney, 2003, p.262).” As they are religiously oriented, there is a strong focus on “rote memorization of Arabic texts (Looney, 2003, p.262).” This is a problem because the students don’t learn to read, write or multiply and “in essence…[are] unlikely play a productive role in creating the type of modern…economy necessary to reduce the [region’s] grinding poverty (Looney, 2003, p. 263).” Another troubling aspect is the “distorted and unnatural version of Islam” that is taught in these madrassahs (Looney, 2003, p. 263). There is a specific focus on jihad and its rewards as opposed to other tenets of Islam (Warren, 2009). This type of indoctrination is further radicalized “by the provision of military training” at these madrassahs (Warren, 2009, p. 9). This type of curriculum coupled with the fact that most the students or pupils are young, impressionable, financially dependent on these madrassahs, and separated from their families for significant periods of times creates a strong likelihood that they will be part of the new generation of extremists and terrorists (Looney, 2003). Madrassahs of this nature must be seen as one of the principal threats to peace and stability because they are spreading their ideology at the grassroots, through the subversion of young and impressionable minds.
Madrassahs have also undermined the social fabric of FATA by intentionally limiting the role of tribal identity. “Emphasis is placed on a person’s religious background “ in these madrassahs rather than on tribal or Pashtun identity (Warren, 2009, p.12). As discussed earlier, the Pashtun identity is strong amongst those who grown up with it. By targeting the youth and intentionally socializing them along their religious identity, these madrassahs have been able to disconnect them from centuries old tradition and customs. This disruption in the social structure has made it easier for the Taliban and other extremist organizations to have influence over the student without a significant force to counteract it (Warren, 2009). This, along with the education they are provided, makes these students “ideal Taliban recruits (Warren, 2009, p.13).” The ability of these madrassahs to subvert students from an early age has made it easier for extremists like the Taliban to undermine the centuries old social fabric of the region.

The state of madrassahs in Pakistan, especially in rural areas like FATA, should be seen a critical priority by the government and its allies. Given the environment in FATA, the existence and expansions of these institutions presents a significant security risk. Without actively confronting this issue, the area and the region at large maybe permanently lost to extremist and terrorist agents. What is even more disturbing is the historic support these madrassahs have received from Pakistan and Saudi Arabia. Pakistan, specifically its Inter Service Intelligence agency, has provided training and support to some of these madrassahs (Warren, 2009). For the most part, Saudi money has financed these madrassahs and helped them become an attractive option to the local and economically deprived population (Warren, 2009). Curbing the growth of madrassahs must be addressed in all dimensions. This requires cutting possible sources financing to
those madrassahs where the curriculum encourages extremism and teaches based on a radical philosophy. Developing and providing alternatives, especially in underdeveloped rural areas like FATA, may also restrict the appeal of madrassahs. Essentially, the state of madrassahs in FATA must be seen as an important consideration with respect to a possible strategy for moderation and stability.

As evident from the discussion in this chapter, FATA requires more than just administrative changes to be on the right track for sustained development. There needs to be a complete transformation of the civil environment in the areas for the region to no longer serve as a shelter for extremists and terrorists. A complete overhaul of FATA will require the implementation of effective interventions that go beyond military operations. These strategies must focus on FATA as a whole, not just in a specific tribal agency or district. Sporadic development will only create further problems and resentment because it will only provide support to the extremist agenda of exposing the negligence of the government towards the people of FATA. While the role of government and NGOs is important part of facilitating development, sustainable development will only be possible if the people of FATA are active participants. In order for them to be part of such an efforts, they will need to be empowered. The social, economic, and political empowerment of the people of FATA must be seen as a long-term strategic goal. The goal must be viewed for its potential to create peace and stability in an area that is extremely volatile. The fundamental basis for overall empowerment can only be done through reforms and strategies that are aimed towards the people with respect to unlocking their potential to be agents of progress and change.
This background on FATA and the role of madrassahs in the area provides an insight into why FATA is vulnerable to extremism and violence. It has all the ingredients necessary for extremist and terrorist organizations to establish a strong foothold, in the form of lack of law and order, underdevelopment, and a physical terrain that provides natural fortification to extremist agents. Furthermore, FATA has now become in a sense the “global headquarters” of Islamic extremism and terrorism due its general feasibility as a base for operations and recruitment (Warren, 2009). This means that the implications of what is going on in FATA are not just limited to the immediate area but to the region and consequently the world at large. This prompts the question, what are some possible interventions and strategies to confront a situation of this magnitude? In chapter 2, possible strategies articulated by experts to confront extremism and terrorism will be discussed and provide a sense of what might be relevant to FATA given the current circumstances.
Chapter 2

An Overview of Strategies and Interventions

The “global war on terror” has made it imperative to develop strategies and improve interventions that tackle extremism and at the same time promote moderation and stability. However, many of the strategies and interventions that are implemented focus on using military force or a series of military campaigns to exterminate terrorists and their strategic capabilities (Campbell & Weitz). Force is seen as a primary mechanism to combat extremism but a technique that rarely addresses extremism in the long-term. Policy experts converge on the understanding that non-military interventions might be able to provide a more effective means of creating an environment of moderation and stability. In their observations, non-military strategies are also effective because they rarely “create a backlash and fuel terrorist ideologies (Imre, Mooney, & Clarke, 2008, p.193).”

In this chapter, strategies and interventions to promote moderation and stability and concurrently promote moderation by experts are discussed to provide a sense of what approaches are available to address the threat of extremism and terrorism.

Approaches, Strategies & Interventions

The following approaches, strategies and interventions emerge from the general literature and discourse available with respect to confronting extremism and promoting moderation.
Assessing the threat. One of the first steps to determining appropriate strategies and interventions is assessing the threat they are being considered to confront. One of the biggest flaws of the process with respect to confronting extremism is that it does not, in various instances, accurately assess the nature of the threat (Imre, Mooney, & Clarke 2008). While it may not seem as obvious, threat assessment can be instrumental with respect to the development of effective interventions and strategies. By not taking this into considerations, significant resources may be drained or wasted. The US invasion of Iraq is the most recent example where the intelligence turned out to be defective and the consequences are now evident with the eruption of even more extremist violence in the region (Imre, Mooney, & Clarke 2008). The nature of the threat determines the response and without addressing this initial evaluation, the viability of proposed strategies is diminished even before they can be implemented on the ground.

Emphasis on non-military strategies. Mainstream policy approaches do recognize the role of military interventions to combat extremism in terms of preventing the imminent loss of innocent lives. However, they explicitly argue for a shift towards strategies that go beyond just using “bullets (Campbell & Weitz).” The literature also emphasizes that extremism, as a threat, is not monolithic and therefore shouldn’t be treated as such. Despite the presence and occasional support of extremist organizations in many Muslim societies, a single strategy for all Muslim societies will not work (Campbell & Weitz). Each situation must be addressed on an individual basis with respect to the local dynamics and culture. Extremism cannot be wiped out simply by eliminating individuals or certain organizations. Effective strategies will need to incorporate long-term solutions aimed addressing the root causes of violent extremism.
Extremist organizations have grassroots networks that must be first eliminated. Many extremist organizations heavily rely on recruiting vulnerable members of the local population to sustain their efforts. In this regard, extremism must be confronted on two fronts, the operational and ideological (Imre, Mooney, & Clarke, 2008). Furthermore, “states must address the threat…within the framework of the rule of law and human rights (Imre, Mooney, Clarke, 2008, p. 192).” With these considerations, non-military strategies can be extremely effective in marginalizing these extremist organizations and minimize their appeal on the local population.

**Political Reforms.** The cornerstone of political reforms articulated by experts is democracy. Democratization is seen as a crucial step in rooting out the spread of extremism and terrorism (UN). Lack of viable political institutions creates serious problems when it comes to confronting such issues. In many areas that are currently experiencing heightened levels of extremism as well as terrorism, their political systems are weak (Kholy, 2006). These weak political systems provide fertile ground for extremist and terrorist groups to take social control by targeting the local populations. Local populations do not have the appropriate means to channel their concerns and grievances (Kholy, 2006). This creates the appropriate channels for infiltration by extremist organizations that exploit the disenfranchisement of the people as the foundation for their appeal and recruitment efforts. In this respect, it can be extremely empowering for a local population to finally get a voice in the administration of their daily affairs and their future. Political systems must be reformed so that they serve as channels of service and participation rather than as conduits for extremist penetration.
Political freedom provides a means for society to collectively deal with the challenges that confront them. Rather than perceiving the government as an external agent, it brings the people closer to it by virtue of their participation. It starts the process of bridging the distance that often exists between people and their government. It deters them from resorting to “anti-regime” violence (Campbell & Weitz). This is important in limiting popular support of extremist and terrorist organization (Campbell & Weitz). Citizens must be able to trust their government and this trust acts as a deterrent from resorting to organizations that feed on this mistrust. States must ensure that the rights of their citizens are protected and not infringed upon. This is especially important because “security and human rights are two sides of the same coin (UN, p. 16)” If extremist organizations get truly marginalized, they will no longer have the capacity to draw people in and over time their presence will diminish and be inconsequential.

It is also important that these political reforms be far reaching. Changing a few administrative elements here and there will not solve the problem. It is essential that these reforms be genuine and even more important that they be perceived as genuine. Political freedom on paper should mean political freedom in society. There cannot be a standard where promises are just kept on paper and never see the light of the day. This is one of the biggest failures in countering extremism because extremist organizations are able to establish a sense of legitimacy compared to government institutions (Kydd & Walter, 2006). They use action as their biggest tools and it lets everyone know that they mean what they say (Kydd & Walter, 2006). Counter extremism measures should work in a similar manner. Political reforms must be substantive; they must not only have the intention of empowerment but should be implemented to produce those very results.
**Socio-economic Reforms.** According to experts, the development of sustainable economic infrastructure is another course of action with respect to creating a moderate and stable civil environment. The lack of such infrastructure and the absence of opportunities fuels frustration that can often find its expression in the form of extremism that can be easily transformed into terrorism (UN). These reforms can be extremely effective in areas where there is extreme poverty and a so-called “youth bulge” (Kholy, 2006). The youth are the most vulnerable to radicalization by extremist organizations mainly because they do not have an alternative outlet for their energies (Yusuf, 2008). Providing the youth with economic opportunities gives them a chance to become productive members of their respective societies. This reduces their vulnerability and removes them from a path where they would be vulnerable to radicalization. Economic deprivation limits the ability of society to be resilient to forces such as extremism. They do not have the capabilities to fight of the influence of extremist organizations, especially when these organizations have the means to provide some form of economic assistance.

Economic development can help in forming a strong middle class that will be able to provide a buffer to the penetration of extremist actors. It assists in creating a community that has a vested interest in local stability. The people need something they can protect and by providing the opportunity for economic development they will have something that provides them with a sense of ownership. Economics determines the power structures and the political interests (Nawaz, 2009). Expanding the availability of economic opportunity to all members of the local population has the ability to provide everyone with some power. In many developing societies, wealth is often concentrated in
the hands of a few. By strengthening the local economy, the local people will have alternative routes to livelihood.

Governmental reforms must be supplemented by the fostering of a viable civil society. A strong civil society can be instrumental in creating an environment that does not provide oxygen to extremism (UN). Many areas that are hotbeds for extremism lack a civil society. Civil society can function as an arena to promote moderation and reduce the appeal of extremism (UN). These reforms should also focus on engaging local institutions and actors that can be supported to provide a level a moderation and stability. Many cultures possess internal mechanisms and actors that are seen as authorities. Using such mechanisms and engaging those actors can strategically utilize social reform to create stability and foster a moderate civil environment (UN). Social reforms must emerge from within, rather than from outside to have a legitimate chance of success. Local institutions and mechanisms should be supported so they have the capabilities to make such reforms possible (UN). Social reform is a broad category and therefore must be carefully utilized for the specific environment. Each society has its problems that can manifest themselves in the form extremism. By directly addressing those problems, the appeal of extremism can be reduced. Social reforms will help in addressing a particular society’s problem. In this regard, both public and private sectors must work together to confront these challenges (Mroz, 2009). Aligning both public and private interest can help in a variety of ways. From resources to efficiency, such partnerships can be an ideal strategy in addressing the problems of society.

**Judicial, Intelligence, and Law Enforcement Reforms.** Along with the previously mentioned strategies, judicial and law enforcement reforms, according to the
experts, are necessary to provide a level of stability. In many areas that are vulnerable to extremist organization, the judicial and law enforcement system is broken and at best extremely fragile (Campbell & Weitz). According to Campbell & Weitz, in terms of law enforcement, police should be seen as a critical link between the government and local communities. “Placing police outside a mosque, religious school, or other sacred institution usually provokes less outrage than stationing soldiers there (Campbell & Weitz, p.21).” Local police or law enforcement, even though representatives of the government, are primarily local institutions and this makes them easier to ensure stability because they are not viewed as outsiders. Police, as locals, have “knowledge of local conditions and criminal procedures” and can be instrumental in terms of “intelligence-gathering (Campbell & Weitz, p.22).” Local law enforcement can provide a strong level of stability especially during sensitive times because they can be mobilized easily.

The lack of law and order contributes to the attractiveness of these areas to extremist and terrorist organizations that thrive on anarchy. They exploit the inability of a government to provide stability and it makes it rational for them to use violence to establish a stronghold (Mroz, 2009). This makes it important to have a strong judicial system that preserves law and order. People must see the local judiciary has an institution of justice rather than as an instrument of suppression. In many developing countries, the judicial system is inconsistent and corrupt. Injustices can just as easily push people towards extremism. Strengthening the judiciary will help stabilize the social fabric and create a central authority that protects and administers the laws of the land.

Judicial and law enforcement reforms have the potential to go into effect quickly and produce tangible results (Campbell & Weitz). However, the “framework [for reform]
has to be developed in a manner in which individual freedom and civil liberty are not undermined (Kholy, 2006, p.31).” It is both a short-term and long-term strategy in this regard. These reforms can help restore faith in government institutions and help provide a means to get people to support the government over extremist organizations. By providing short-term and long-term security and civil stability, the power vacuums that extremist organizations exploit will also become increasingly hard to manipulate. Such locations will not be attractive to extremist groups since they will not be able to establish a stronghold through local support and participation.

**Education.** Education is viewed as a strategy of potential.

“Expanding…educational opportunities and increasing investment in education at all levels” is seen as a strong policy focus with respect to confronting extremism (Kholy, 2006, p. 31). Increasing the availability of a traditional and quality education for the poor is a vital step in creating a social fabric that deters extremism. Education has the ability to foster such an environment because it helps create a social fabric that rooted in dialogue, tolerance and non-violence (Kholy, 2006). Building or starting to build an infrastructure for primary and secondary schooling can have a positive impact on the local community. While it would naïve to think that education can completely eliminate extremism, it can definitely go a long way in reducing its influence and restricting its capabilities. Education is a protracted strategy that can fundamentally transform a society and position it to move along the development process.

Rehabilitation and disengagement programs have also emerged as another strategy within the realm of education. Education can be an essential part of a rehabilitation process for those who have disengaged from violent extremism.
(Chowdhury & Hearne, 2008). This type of education is designed to prepare “violent extremist detainees for re-integration into society upon their release from incarceration (UN, p.18).” This type of education can prove to be critical because it can “assist offenders in developing skills necessary for a successful reintegration into society (UN, p.18).” Rehabilitation programs may need to be protracted as well in order to prevent the “relapse” of individuals back to violent extremism. The nature and quality of these programs needs to be a significant priority in order for them to be effective.

Facilitating cooperative relationships and partnerships. Cooperation and sharing best practices is another strategy that emerges from these reports. Such a strategy will help in acquiring a positive response to efforts to quell extremism locally, regionally, and globally. Facilitating such relationships can help in getting a better sense of what works and what doesn’t. It can eventually lead to a comprehensive compilation of “best practices and experiences in setting up a disengagement or deradicalization program (Chowdhury & Hearne, 2008, p.ii).” Such programs could prove to be instrumental in providing a systematic means to confront extremism and promote moderation. Such relationships and partnerships will also establish a sense of global interdependency with respect to fighting extremism (Mroz, 2009). Utilizing the forces of globalization to confront terror can make it easier to harness already present structures and mechanisms to create a more effective and efficient strategy. “Countries that oppose terrorism must establish new means of communication to deal with it (Kholy, 2006, p. 28).” Communication can prove to be instrumental in facilitating dialogue at the international level and provide the means to formulate an effective response to extremism.

Cooperative partnerships help strengthen a country’s capacity to fight extremism
and promote moderation without straining traditional resources such as money and manpower. “The State alone does not have all the resources necessary to counter radicalization and deal with violent extremism (UN, p.6).” Cooperative partnerships can involve reaching out to civil society and local communities (UN). One of the benefits of involving civil society and local communities is that it “enhances trust and transparency and strengthens social cohesion (UN, p.6).” Trust and transparency can provide effective buffers against extremism because it builds confidence in the state as opposed to resentment. Since extremist groups exploit people’s frustrations with the state to promote their own agenda, this strategy can help reduce their influence on a local population and eventually eliminate any support for them.

As part of this cooperation, developing and sharing information needs to be a priority. Currently, the absence of this particular strategy has made it difficult to develop a cohesive manner to accomplish this (UN). This ultimately has undermined the development of an international capacity with respect to sharing the best practices to combat extremism and promote moderation (Chowdhury & Hearne, 2008). There have been successful instances of the dismantling of extremist and terrorist organizations in the past (Campbell & Weitz). However, the absence of cooperative mechanisms at the international level has made it hard for countries to specifically learn from past strategies with respect to what has worked and what hasn’t (Chowdhury & Hearne, 2008). By consciously focusing the developing and sharing information as part of a strategy cooperation, important lessons can be learned and assist in the development of a mechanism to combat to extremism.
As these approaches, interventions, and strategies suggest, much of the current discourse relating to the promotion of peace and stability is focused on fact that extremism and consequently terrorism are manifestations of societal problems. Scholars tend to converge on certain approaches to enabling peace and stability. The literature discussed in this chapter provides a holistic picture of what traditional approaches, strategies, and interventions have been utilized in the past and are seen as viable options. It is clear that within the realm of political science and international relations, mainstream approaches to confronting extremism and terror have a specific emphasis on non-military interventions and strategies. There is also a focus on addressing the circumstances that encourage and enhance the appeal of extremism and terrorism (Imre, Mooney, & Clarke 2008). The struggle against extremism will “not be won or lost on a conventional military battlefield (Imre, Mooney, & Clarke, 2008, p.191).” In political science literature pertaining to extremism, there is also growing consensus on the importance of historical instances of the dismantlement of extremist and terrorist organizations (Imre, Mooney, & Clarke 2008). In this regard, many of the past approaches to tackling extremism reveal two strategic layers of confronting extremism. The first strategic layer pertains to the operational aspect of extremist organizations and possible methods to dismantle it. The second strategic layer concerns the grassroots ideologies that sustain them (Imre, Mooney, & Clarke 2008). These two layers are both important in effectively dismantling the capabilities and roots of extremism. However, these two layers cannot be addressed separately but must be engaged concurrently. Without this deliberate focus in efforts, any intervention or strategy will be inherently limited in its ability to be effective. The operational and ideological capacities of extremist organizations cannot be dismantled
“until human rights are respected, repression is lifted, corruption is minimized or eliminated, poverty and ignorance are reduced, and children receive a balanced education that promotes moderation, tolerance, peaceful resolution of disputes and compassion (Imre, Mooney, & Clarke, 2008, p. 206).” Simply, the ability of extremist organizations to exploit the socio-economic deficiencies must be restricted in order to truly marginalize them. Non-military interventions have a significant role to play in the dismantling of extremism because they have the potential to counter it at both the operational and ideological level concurrently.

With respect to the central question of this senior project, the effectiveness of education in confronting extremism also emerges as part of a larger consensus. “Education…features strongly in counter-radicalisation programmes developed by States (UN, p.9).” For example, programs that “promote inter-cultural understanding and citizenship” are an integral part of the curriculum in countries like the United Kingdom, Austria, Netherlands, and Yemen (UN, p. 9). Education is a grassroots strategy where primary and secondary schooling can be intentionally utilized to “build citizenship education and social integration…as part of their curricula (UN, p.9).” Clearly education has the potential to develop “a resilient community that upholds values of non-violence, peaceful co-existence and tolerance (UN, p. 9).” This aspect of education will be discussed in chapter 3 where education is specifically analyzed as a tool for moderation and stability.
Chapter 3

Education as a Tool for Moderation and Stability

Education has the potential to transform communities and societies. It is viewed as a “very good investment (UK Department For International Development [DFID], 2010, p.11).” Many experts continuously advocate the expansion of provisions for education in their arguments as a possible pathway to “democracy, stability and security (DFID, 2010, p.11).” These attributes of social stability restrict the influence of extremist networks at the grassroots. Education can lay a fundamentally strong foundation for many of the interventions and strategies discussed in chapter 2. It helps bridge the gap that time and underdevelopment have created in certain parts of the world, especially where extremism is on the rise. In this regard, education plays a critical role in preparing societies for positive change, especially those that are prone to conflict (Zasloff, Shapiro, & Coyne 2009). It is “an important component of fostering positive change in social values, attitudes and skills that are necessary to overcome the pain of conflict and to cope with the frustrations involved in a peace process (Zasloff, Shapiro, & Coyne, 2009, p.1).” This impact of education in general but specifically in conflict prone regions and societies can be instrumental for progress. “Education has been able to make an important contribution to reconciliation, conflict prevention, post-conflict reconstruction, and the re-building of war-torn societies (Zasloff, Shapiro, & Coyne 2009, p.1).” These observations and considerations provide hope that education can create an environment for moderation and stability.
In this chapter, education as a tool for promoting moderation and fostering stability is discussed. The first part of the chapter discusses the claims of education with respect to eliminating poverty (economic growth), laying the foundation of a viable political system, fostering a civil society and promoting equality, justice and stability. Barriers to education are discussed in the next section and how they impact the effectiveness of education as a strategy. The following section discusses the various educational strategies articulated by experts and how they achieve the previously discussed claims of education and address barriers to it. The purpose of this chapter is to provide a sense of the potential of education, how it can be achieved, and where it might be inadequate. This knowledge will be critical in the next chapter where educational reform in FATA is discussed and analyzed.

Claims

Studies have demonstrated the positive effects education provides. According to a report by the US Institute of Peace that looked at the viability of education as a path to peace with respect to the Israeli-Palestinian conflict, education can contribute to “promoting conflict resolution and reconciliation at the grassroots level (Zasloff, Shapiro, & Coyne, 2009, p.1).” This is primarily because education can help “build a supportive environment in the wider society for a peace settlement or its implementation (Zasloff, Shapiro, & Coyne 2009, p.2).” This impact of education is exactly the reason why it should be seen as such a critical element in promoting moderation and stability. Many of the strategies and interventions that are implemented fail because they are in an environment that is hostile to their success and to development in general. The barrier of extremism is hard to cross without the proper mechanisms in place. Extremism thrives in
environments of suppression, underdevelopment, and chaos. For any interventions to be successful, there will first need to be a concentrated effort to build the right environment for them to be effective. This can be achieved through the development of a viable educational infrastructure that is tailored for each environment. Through this approach an environment for maximizing the impact of other reforms and interventions will be able to exist.

Education provides a direct path to poverty alleviation. According to a report by the Center for Global Development (CGD), “in many poor countries, with each additional year of schooling, people earn 10% higher wages (“Education and the Developing World,” 2006).” This demonstrates that increasing opportunities for education can drastically impact the socio-economic environment of an area. By enhancing their skills and capabilities, people in developing countries can take advantage of and create economic opportunities for themselves (CGD, 2006). Education provides the tools for innovation and entrepreneurship that lead the way for economic opportunity and development (Herz & Sperling, 2004). Since it is a strategy that focuses on the empowerment of individuals and communities, it fosters a culture of progress rather than just the intent for it. As a grassroots strategy, education is able to foster an intrinsic change rather than a superficial improvement in short-term circumstances. In the long-term, it helps create a knowledge based economic infrastructure that generates a skilled labor force (Zasloff, Shapiro, & Coyne 2009). Consequently, the presence of skilled labor forces can contribute to the development of a sustainable economic environment because its skills can adapt to economic volatility. Furthermore, education provides a means to higher productivity that in turns translates into a better return on investment (Herz &
Sperling, 2004). This higher productivity can be a direct result of people replacing obsolete practices with newly acquired innovative and efficient methods. The application of new and improved practices will allow the economic activities to have more depth and therefore be resilient to drastic changes that would otherwise have a negative impact.

A viable political system is almost impossible without a sustainable infrastructure for education. Education provides the means for people to learn about their political rights and how they can exercise them (CGD, 2006). In many developing areas, the political system remains a source of corruption and suppression that is dominated by the elites. Education can bridge the gap between people from all economic backgrounds providing the initial step to increasing political participation. For democratic institutions and processes to be effective, people must know of their importance and understand their role in the democratic process. For example, free elections are seen to be such a crucial step towards the development democracy. However, in many developing countries, the term “free” is rather relative. Socio-economic disparities only make it possible for free elections to continue the status quo in a “democratic” form. Education can bridge this gap by reducing economic and gender disparities to make way for strong democratic traditions. In this regard, education can provide the means to move away from artificial democracy to an authentic one. This will create the environment for political reforms to be much more effective rather than being perceived as mere bureaucratic changes. Democracy must be exercised rather than just be discussed or debated for it to actually make a substantive difference. This only can come about through an educated citizenry that understand its role within the political process.
Education contributes to the development of a civil society, an institution that is instrumental with respect to tackling the influence of extremism. Many developing societies lack a strong or any civil society mainly because the social mechanisms aren’t in place for it to be relevant. Education empowers people to use their new skills not only for economic purposes but also in forming a strong social net for their communities (Mortensen & Relin, 2006). This social net can eventually evolve into a civil society for these particular communities. This process enhances a community’s resilience (UN). An educated populace will not only be engaged economically but also socially and politically. An education can provide a strong sense of citizen ownership that can provide the foundation for regular citizens to create institutions for their own communities.

Equality, justice and stability can only be possible if the environment that is favorable to them exists. Creating that environment can be possible through an education infrastructure that is designed to promote equality, enhance justice, and provide stability. Doing all this is not simple and that’s why it’s so important to have the educational framework in place that continuously fosters these values. The curriculum and general focus of learning must be intended to promote these values within the context of the specific environment. This will help make it possible to lay groundwork for a new generation of people to put these values in to practice through their own efforts. Creative thinking must be an intentional component of an education infrastructure and students must be given the independence to reach their conclusions, for better or for worse. Education must provide a sense ownership that makes it easier for people to relate to their environments.
Female education is a specific approach that holds potential for the transformation of communities. In many developing countries, women and young girls are unable to attend school primarily because those particular societies do not see any utility in sending them to school (Herz & Sperling, 2004). Women’s role is restricted to the household and education is viewed as a luxury rather than a necessity (Herz & Sperling, 2004).

Expanding educational provisions to specifically focus on female education can provide a route for social transformation. Female education impacts entire communities, areas and regions (Herz & Sperling, 2004). Education allows women to become engaged and productive citizens because they possess necessary and critical skills. Apart from the economic impact, the social impact of female education is unlimited. Educating women reduces fertility rates because educated women utilize family planning, get married later, and have fewer children than compared to uneducated women (Herz & Sperling, 2004).

Studies suggest that an additional year of female schooling reduces fertility by 5-10 percent (Herz & Sperling, 2004). Formal education also prepares women to be better caretakers with respect to nutrition and sanitation (Herz & Sperling, 2004). This knowledge can substantially reduce mortality rates (Herz & Sperling, 2004). In general, a formal education can provide a path to a safe and healthier lifestyle that in turn creates healthier communities (Herz & Sperling, 2004). Furthermore, a formal education enables women to become part of the skilled labor force and contribute to economic growth (Herz & Sperling, 2004).

One of the most crucial ways female education enhances a society is through the generational effect it can have. Women are more likely to send their children to school if they have some form of education themselves (Herz & Sperling, 2004). This is exactly why female education is so crucial because it can impact the opportunities and
education levels of their children. This impact on the next generation of a community can virtually transform the socio-economic landscape and make way for peace and progress.

**Barriers to Education**

Education as a strategy faces many barriers to its viability. These barriers include:

**Accessibility.** In developing areas, especially those with an ongoing conflict, schools and education in general can be virtually inaccessible. This realization is important because “around half of the children out of school now live in fragile and conflict affected states (DFID, 2010, p.14).” Even if there are schools available, getting to them and making sure they remain open is extremely difficult (Sommers, 2002). Violence and conflict also make it difficult to create an environment that is conducive to learning and scholarship (DFID, 2010). Even though the environment within schools maybe peaceful, once students leaves the premises they are thrust back into the midst of conflict. This makes it difficult for education to have its desired effects because it reduces the likelihood that those pursuing an education will complete it (Sommers, 2002). While there have been improvements with respect to mechanisms to get children to school, the have not been as substantial to address the scope of the problem (DFID, 2010). Addressing the barrier to accessibility will require a creative approach. This approach must address elements “within and outside of the education sector (DFID, 2010).”

**Socio-economic and political environment.** The nature of the economy in developing areas is another barrier. Many rural economies are structured around pastoral
or agricultural activities and are severely underdeveloped. In many cases, this requires entire families, including children and especially young girls, to contribute to the family’s livelihood (Chitrakar, 2009). The opportunity cost of sending children to school for is relatively high for parents from this perspective. The possibility of an education for them is especially out of the question. Families have to choose to between putting food on the table or sending the children to school. Furthermore, schooling requires books and supplies. These added costs make it even more difficult to consider the possibility of education. Getting past this roadblock demands an approach to ensure that the opportunity costs of attending school are specifically addressed within the framework of education for developing areas and regions.

Education needs to be a top national priority for developing nations. Rhetoric promoting education alone is not enough. Leaders of developing nations must ensure that their verbal commitments are incorporated into national policies. “Experience from countries such as China, Morocco, Sri Lanka, and Uganda suggests high-level government leadership is key to raising the profile of education (Herz & Sperling, 2004, p.14).” Prioritizing education, specifically in the national budget, like Uganda’s did for primary education. Uganda increased its budget allocation for education from 11 to 22 percent (Herz & Sperling, 2004). At this rate, Uganda will achieve universal education by 2015 (Herz & Sperling, 2004). Budgetary allocation must be done within a framework of education as a strategy. Adopting a national framework for education, developing countries can “catalyze rapid and substantial improvements in girls’ (and boys’) education (Herz & Sperling 2004 citing Sperling 2001 & Herz 2002).” The lack of a political and national priority remains a significant barrier to the potential of education.
**Gender Inequalities.** In many parts of the developing world, gender inequalities play a significant role. In many cases, males are given priority over females with respect to resources and needs, especially when it comes to education (Chitrakar, 2009). This is because the opportunity cost, in developing countries, is perceived to be greater with respect to women and girls. “In many African and Asian countries, daughters are the victims of a self-fulfilling prophecy: as they are traditionally expected to do more chores at home than are sons, the opportunity cost of educating them seems higher and so they are kept home (Herz & Sperling, 2004, p. 8).” This cultural attitude will need to be addressed as part of a strategy to promote moderation because women can play instrumental roles in creating safer communities. Gender disparities and inequalities are a problem within the large context of development, not just education. However, as a grassroots strategy, eliminating this inequality needs to be addressed at the basic level. Educating a new generation of boy and girls as equals increases the chances that such disparities will eventually be marginalized if not completely eliminated.

**Funding.** As with most development projects, financial support is an essential element of providing education. The recent economic crisis has made it difficult for many countries and international donors to stay committed, especially when there is need elsewhere. However, “now is not the time for governments in low income countries and donor agencies to lessen their commitment to education (DFID, 2010, p.13).” The dynamic nature of the global economy demands that people be educated with modern knowledge and skills (DFID 2010). Limiting funding for education, especially in underdeveloped areas, only continues to perpetuate the cycle of poverty and social instability. Analyzing education from a long-term economic perspective helps in
determining its actual priority as opposed to its perceived priority. Increasing provisions for education in budgets provides the means to overcoming the direct, indirect and opportunity costs education imposes on the poor (Herz & Sperling 2004). For example, enrollment increased by 70 percent in Uganda as soon as school fees were eliminated (Herz & Sperling 2004). However, the current state of funding for education remains limited. The financing gap for education is estimated at about $16 billion every year (DFID 2010). This means that an additional $16 billion is needed to address the educational needs of the world’s population that currently does not have access to it.

**Strategies for Education**

The importance of education as a strategy to confront extremism is evident but the question is how can it be a tool for moderation and stability, especially in rural areas? Educational strategies must focus on addressing potential barriers and producing learning outcomes that create the environment for moderation and stability. In addition, the strategies must be formulated based on the specific environment of an area. The nature of education and its infrastructure is the most important aspect of education as a strategy for promoting moderation. A curriculum that promotes dialogue, understanding, tolerance, and a holistic learning experience is critical for this strategy to have the desired impacts. The nature of the education system must be structured so that its learning outcomes include applying the lessons of the classroom to the “real world.” Simply, the education being provided must be relevant to its environment. Each area in developing world has its own needs that must be factored in the development of the infrastructure. Without this consideration, the infrastructure may easily become irrelevant. The nature of the education and its infrastructure must be sensitive to the needs of the local population.
This approach helps facilitate the development of an environment that is conducive to peace and stability. In this part of the chapter, specific educational strategies articulated by various studies are outlined and if they are effective or limited in achieving the claims of education.

**A quality education must be accessible to all members of the population.** In many developing countries, gender and other forms of discrimination cause only a particular group to have access to educational services (Atchoarena & Gasperini 2003). This trend is responsible for all forms of socio-economic disparities that later create larger problems and provide a pathway to extremism. Expanding the access and availability of education will provide the means to reach all parts of population and help move a community towards equality, justice, and stability. This is one of the cornerstones of education a strategy of moderation. EFA or *Education For All* must be made a priority (International Institute for Educational Policy (IIEP), 2002). This is especially important for areas that have been traditionally “under-served” in terms of educational development (IIEP, 2002). Looking at examples of countries like Uganda that have made education a top priority and reflect that in their national budgets, the possibility exists to make education possible for all in developing nations.

**Provisions for primary and secondary education in rural areas.** As younger members of the population slowly get introduced to formal education, the better the learning outcomes from a qualitative perspective (IIEP, 2002). Many developing areas lack basic facilities for child education. Starting from the grassroots and expanding the availability of primary and secondary education will help provide a path to the development of higher forms of education in developing areas (IIEP, 2002). This will
start the process of moving towards universal education and help provide the new
generation with unlimited capabilities in terms of development.

Placing particular emphasis on female education. As discussed earlier, female
education can have a significant impact on a community. The most important element of
female education is creating an inclusive environment for women and girls to thrive
academically (UNICEF, 2004a). This means the curriculum and classroom needs to be
gender neutral (UNICEF, 2004a). Women and girls must be given the sense of
individuality and independence that are their human rights to begin with (Herz &
Sperling, 2004). In many developing areas women are treated as subordinates. This can
have negative consequences on their psychological development and prevent them from
becoming active and productive members of their communities. Placing a particular
emphasis on female education will provide a means for empowering young girls and
women in rural communities and giving them the confidence to succeed despite societal
attitudes.

Providing adequate training and support for teachers in developing areas
and regions. Education is important but the educators are equally if not more important.
Ensuring the availability of quality teachers is the one of the fundamental steps to
ensuring a quality education (Herz & Sperling, 2004). In this regard, public-private
partnerships could be really helpful in terms of providing incentives and resources for
potential teachers and instructors to be available in rural areas. Instructors and teachers
must not only be trained in general education but also for the environment where they
will be teaching (UNICEF, 2004a). This is particularly important in the early stages of
developing an infrastructure for education because of the lack of trained teachers and
instructors at the local level. Until the time when local teachers and instructors become adequately trained available, the teachers and instructor should go through training that prepares them for their roles in the various communities. They must be trained to be sensitive to and understand the communities they will be serving. This will be critical to achieving the desired learning outcomes. Finally, their compensation should be structured in way that provides them with an incentive to stay in these rural areas and assist the development of these communities.

Developing public private partnerships. The public sphere has always taken the responsibility of developing an educational infrastructure in developing nations. In this process, due to constraints resources, the quality and accessibility of education has suffered (Patrinos, Barrera-Osorio, & Juliana, 2009). In this regard, the private sector can contribute by supporting areas where the public sector falls short (Patrinos, Barrera-Osorio, & Juliana, 2009). This type of complementary partnership can help developing areas build an infrastructure of quality and accessible education. This complementary partnership utilizes the strengths of both sides and helps addresses the weaknesses through cooperation. In this regard, public-private partnerships can provide innovative means to develop a framework for education in a feasible manner. Despite what many people might think, private education is not reserved for the elite, upper or middle classes any more. Private education has found its way to serve the poor and the underprivileged. This expansion in the provisions for private education has allowed private schools to target not only high-income families but also low-income households (Patrinos, Barrera-Osorio, & Juliana, 2009). Partnerships that enhance the feasibility of education are essential for this strategy to be meaningful and effective.
Utilizing education as a process of community empowerment. It would be counterproductive to build schools in a region or area where the local community has no connection or involvement with them. It is crucial that local communities be active partners in the development of their local infrastructure for education (UNICEF, 2004a). This provides a sense of ownership and dignity that can lead to grassroots support for such an infrastructure. With this strategy, the development of infrastructure is seen as an internal matter rather than an external affair. For example, a study in Pakistan finds that rural community-based schools increase girls’ enrollments to more than four times the provincial average (Herz & Sperling, 2004). Community involvement can provide a strong foundation for the viability of the educational infrastructure and make it easier for it to become a priority for the community. Through this process, the whole community will be better able to comprehend the need for an educational infrastructure.

Structuring school calendars and building them based on the needs of the area. As discussed before, in many rural areas, the whole family is responsible for the labor with respect to agricultural and pastoral activities. This makes it difficult, in some environments, to have the traditional academic calendar and day because during the day or certain parts of the year the whole household is devoted to agricultural and pastoral activities. Including provisions for flexibility when designing an academic curriculum, the effectiveness of any education is enhanced because it is able to accommodate student with the kinds of time restrictions that would otherwise prevent them from attending school (UNICEF, 2004a). Furthermore, building schools in an accessible and central location increases the prospects of attendance (Herz & Sperling, 2004). These
improvements can help strengthen the case of education in developing areas because they reduce some of the “opportunity costs” of education.

Developing specific learning outcomes. Part of developing an educational infrastructure requires a conscious idea or outline of what is expected with respect to results (Herz & Sperling, 2004). Education and its philosophy must center on some purpose, mission, and vision. Without this, the infrastructure will lack direction and might actually become detrimental. Consciously setting learning outcomes will help with development of the infrastructure by ensuring that the necessary provisions and mechanisms are included to make those outcomes possible and also feasible. Setting unrealistic goals is a bad strategy for developing rural areas due to their fragility. A sense of realistic goals and expectations will help guide with the process of building an infrastructure and at the same time ensure that those goals are reached or attained. This can also be a deciding factor for effectiveness of education as moderating and stabilizing tool.

Creating a non-formal educational infrastructure that serves non-traditional needs. Many developing societies have a significant portion of potential non-traditional students. Non-traditional students in the sense that they might not be school aged children or teenagers and therefore need a different approach with respect to learning. In such circumstances they cannot afford to drop their main activities and decide to pursue an education without severe economic consequences for their families. Developing an infrastructure that accommodates for their needs is helpful. This infrastructure could include providing vocational and technical education that they would otherwise not have
access to. Their education can also be structured along the lines of incentives and benefits in exchange for their willingness to attend school or some form of formal training.

An integral part of this specific strategy is the development of rehabilitation and disengagement programs. These programs have recently emerged as effective measures to address violent extremism and extremism in general from a new perspective. Including provisions for those that have disengaged from extremism can provide legitimacy to government and non-governmental efforts and maybe even persuade others to do the same. For example, Saudi Arabia “designed and introduced a special rehabilitation programme in 2006, the al Ria’ya (Care) programme (UN, p.18).” The programme provides psychological counseling, religious education and promotes debate and dialogue between [participants] and the organizers of the programme (UN p.18).” However, the effectiveness of these programs depends on their quality and poorly designed programs may actually cause more damage.

**Developing a strong commitment to the financing of education projects in developing regions, especially rural areas.** There is no doubt that one of the biggest barriers to development of viable educational infrastructures is the lack of financial resources, especially for developing areas. In this regard, innovative strategies must be explored, especially the role public-private partnerships in providing capital and funding in general. Developing a consistent and strong financing strategy will ensure that all of the approaches and programs discussed are possible. Funding for these projects should be seen as critical part of a long-term economic and security policy rather than as a burden on national budgets. Developing strong infrastructures for education will help create a safer world that no amount of defense spending could ever achieve. Developed countries
must be persuaded to honor their previous pledges that have yet to be delivered (UNICEF, 2004c). Realizing this impact of education can make the difference in the cost-benefit analysis and make way for more funding for such projects around the world.

Education must be seen as a practical investment that is needed and not a luxury that countries can go without. Governments and leaders must realize the importance of allocating significant funds to education as part of a long-term strategy. In addition, developing countries need to reach out to the international community in order not only to secure financing but also specific strategies to do it. The World Bank has initiatives in place that are specifically designed for financing education related projects in underdeveloped areas (Herz & Sperling, 2004). However, developing nations need to demonstrate their willingness to support education through internal reforms and frameworks that focus on education. A strong appeal to potential donors is demonstrating that serious efforts are underway nationally to promote education. Developing nations also need to reach out to other nations that have been successful in promoting education despite constraints on financial resources. Those lessons can be invaluable especially within a regional context.

Education is a feasible strategy for promoting moderation and fostering a stable civil environment. However, its feasibility depends on the nature, design, financing and process of implementation. The particular strategies that are utilized with respect to education are a critical part of the toolkit for moderation and stability. In the next chapter, the strategies articulated in this chapter are applied to the Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA) of Pakistan. It analyzes the effectiveness of these strategies given the overall environment of the area. The chapter gives priorities to certain strategies based on
the situation in FATA that was discussed in chapter 1 and explores what else needs to be done to promote moderation and stability in FATA.
Chapter 4

Educational Reform in FATA

*The greatest threat to Pakistan’s future may be its abysmal education system.*

-Dr. Pervez Hoodbhoy

The current state of education in Pakistan is troubling at best. Pakistan lags behind internationally and regionally in education related indicators (Pakistan National Education Policy 2009). “The UN Development Programme’s Human Development Report gives Pakistan the lowest “education index” score of any country outside Africa (Hathaway, 2005, p.2).” Pakistan’s prevalent culture of corruption within its political and bureaucratic infrastructure makes serious reforms difficult to implement and achieve. It is no surprise then that this condition with respect to education is extended to FATA. The deficiencies within Pakistan’s education system are even more pronounced in FATA, where hardly any resources are allocated for such development. In FATA, madrassahs are the only vestiges of what could possibly be considered an education system. However, these madrassahs are primarily institutions of indoctrination rather than centers of learning. The stronghold of extremism and the unpredictability of the extremist actors in the area make it difficult but not impossible to introduce and sustain educational reforms. However, by addressing certain basic deficiencies and engaging moderate agents within the power structure of FATA, educational reforms have the potential to be transformative.
The central question of this project centers on the role of education as a tool for moderation and stability in the Federally Administered Tribal Areas of Pakistan. The discussions in the last two chapters demonstrated that education holds significant potential as a grassroots strategy to help build an environment for positive change and help orient a society towards development. In this chapter, education as a strategy for peace and stability in FATA is tested and analyzed with respect to the dynamics of the region.

**Barriers and Opportunities in FATA**

By any measure, FATA represents a challenge to implementing sustainable reforms. With respect to educational reforms or most reforms in general, the following barriers become salient:

**Power Dynamics.** One of the most important considerations to any reforms in FATA is having a sense of the power dynamics of the region. These power dynamics influence the integrity and viability of strategies for development. FATA is a wilderness as far as governance is concerned. FATA’s “institutionalized democracy deficit and the marginalization of the state’s traditional power centers by the Taliban and the army has created a political vacuum (Haider, 2009, p.7).” Furthermore, the parallel governance mechanisms in place such as the FCR and Tribal “jirgas” have made it difficult to instill any sense of consistency with respect to the rule of law. The political vacuum has resulted in significant of manipulation of power by the actors in region including tribal (Pashtun) leaders, Taliban leadership/franchisee groups and the political agents (PA). The diversified power structures will need to be “streamlined” in order to implement
educational reforms. However, given the nature of reforms, it can be expected that there will be significant opposition from agents who have “benefited from the existing system (Haider, 2009, p.15).” With this consideration, efforts concerning educational reform also need to engage moderate elements within FATA’s power structures.

**Tribal & Religious Opposition to Reforms.** State and non-state actors alike need to create strategic alliances with the Pashtun and moderate religious leadership in FATA. There are many reasons for forging these strategic alliances. First, such alliances can provide a sense of legitimacy with respect to reforms. The Pashtun attitude towards outside influences and the overall religious sentiment need to be accommodating for education or any other strategy to be viable (Haider 2009). There is a “perception that the state has exploited FATA’s people for military and jihadi ventures…yet has not advanced their welfare (Haider, 2009, p.16)” These grievances must be taken seriously for a reform agenda to be effectively advanced in FATA.

Secondly, directly involving the local leadership creates a possibility for partnerships. One of the most relevant examples of this kind of approach is the work of Greg Mortensen, an activist who helps builds schools in Pakistan and Afghanistan. Reading through *Three Cups of Tea* and *Stones in to Schools*, a theme emerges with respect to the relative success of Mortensen’s efforts. The schools he helps build are dependent on their local communities, not independent of them. The analogy of the three cups of tea has never been more important in determining the importance of local relationships and partnerships. Mortensen consistently acknowledges the importance of his relationships with tribal and religious leadership as a key part of his success in
creating a viable network of schools. These experiences must be considered with respect to formulating a reform policy towards a region like FATA.

**Stability.** As discussed in chapter 1, the issue of stability in FATA remains salient. However, the “prevalent belief among…officials that due to the dire security situation in FATA, many reforms at this stage are not possible” is overlooking “the role reforms can play in generating support among FATA’s people for the Pakistani government-an essential element in a viable [strategy to confront extremism] (Haider, 2009, p. 16-17).” This realization is important for both the Pakistani government and its allies. Refraining from a reform agenda based on the issues of stability is only providing opportunity to extremist agents and others benefitting from the current system to continue to amass power and influence. The process of formulating a reform agenda and implementing it can result in preparing FATA for positive change and starting the process of rebuilding the socio-economic infrastructure.

**Recommendations**

The central question of this senior project explores the viability of education as a strategy for stability and moderation in FATA. Given the fact that “an overarching feature of FATA’s society is rampant illiteracy…[a reform agenda] will require laying the ground work [for] educating FATA’s people (Haider, 2009, p.16). With this consideration, educational strategies articulated in chapter 3, the barriers and opportunities in FATA, certain short and long-term recommendations involving local, regional, and international actors need to be considered. These recommendations are: 1.) Reform FATA’s institutions and bureaucracies 2.) Develop and implement a practical
framework for education in FATA 3.) Secure dependable financing for educational projects to ensure quality and accessibility 4.) Place emphasis on female education 5.) Develop a relevant curriculum 6.) Facilitate general flexibility 7.) Include provisions for non-traditional students 8.) Ensure the availability of qualified teachers and instructors 9.) Directly involve the local community as equal partners 10.) Develop a monitoring and quality assurance system. These recommendations are analyzed in this chapter with respect to their effectiveness in FATA.

**Recommendation 1: Reform FATA’s institutions and bureaucracies.** FATA administrative political agencies suffer from the general trend of corruption that is manifested in other provincial governments and federal government of Pakistan. For educational reform to be possible, these institutions and bureaucracies must be streamlined. This is critical because it is these institutions that will primarily be charged with the implementation of an educational framework in FATA. In this regard, the powers of the PA (Political Agent) will need to be limited. “The PA has become the symbol of FATA’s repressive system (Haider, 2009, p.21).” For people of FATA to trust the state and its policies, restoring integrity to the political and judicial mechanisms is necessary. Political and judicial integrity will help reduce the prevalence of power vacuums in the area of addressing the grievances of the people and prevent extremist organizations like the Taliban from exploiting them.

Existing institutions such as the FATA Development Authority must be strengthened and charged with the development of a viable educational infrastructure as a fundamental priority. The information available on FATA Development Authority’s website does not include a specific section on education apart from information on
certain vocational programs. This should be a cause of concern in an area that does not have a single institution of higher learning. The development authority must shift its focus on creating infrastructure for education if it hopes to accomplish any of its other goals. As the youth are the most vulnerable elements of the population and often targeted by extremist organizations as recruits, primary and secondary education must become a priority for the FATA development authority. All the projects listed as part of the authority’s purpose are important and justified. However, these reforms and projects will not be sustainable without the presence a local skilled labor force. The first step in this process is to build institutions that can start the process of educating FATA’s young generation to be FATA’s next leaders. This process will require sacrifices certain projects in the hopes that shifting those resources towards education is more likely to produce a sustainable economic base. All this ultimately depends on the current FATA and Pakistani leadership and their willingness to not only support education in rhetoric but in actual programs and budgetary allocations. At this time, it does not seem likely that such a change in policy will likely occur.

**Recommendation 2: Develop and implement a practical framework for education in FATA.** The three different educational systems exist in Pakistan, public, private and religious with no clearly regulated standards and procedures follow. In FATA, the domination of madrassahs as the primary venue of “education” needs to be actively confronted. These madrassahs are the biggest threat to the deteriorating situation of the region as they re-enforce the extremist agenda. The continued subversion of the youth at these madrassahs is ensuring the sustainability of extremism and will be harder to contain with the passage of time. A clear and relevant framework for education in
FATA needs to be a top priority for the Pakistan government and its allies. This framework needs to incorporate the needs of the people not only within the realm of education but also outside of it. The policy needs to factor in the specific barriers that the people in FATA face with respect to attaining an education. These barriers include the costs (direct and indirect), religious, and cultural sensibilities. The consideration of these barriers is important because then policy can specifically address them. Without being consciously aware of the obstacles, an irrelevant framework and education program is more than likely to emerge.

**Recommendation 3: Secure dependable financing for educational projects to ensure feasibility, quality and accessibility in FATA.** As discussed in the last chapter, one of the obstacles to developing a viable educational infrastructure is financing it. Developing countries do not possess the resources to finance such projects independently. This is especially true for FATA, one of the poorest and most underdeveloped areas in Pakistan (Nawaz 2009). Pakistan itself is struggling to keep itself economically and politically afloat. However, Pakistan must demonstrate its commitment to educational reform in FATA by allocating significant funds to the region for the purpose of educational reform. As discussed in the previous chapter, poor countries like Uganda have increased provisions for education despite their financial capabilities. To make up for the gap that public financing cannot fill, the role of public-private partnerships can be instrumental as well as the willingness of international donors, especially developed nations who experience with such reforms. While the United States and other nations have been providing aid to Pakistan, this aid has been primarily been directed towards military operations and infrastructure. This is seems reasonable in the short-term
especially given the insurgent situation in FATA. However, continuing to battle with extremist actors at the military level is not going to produce the long-term stability that is required. In a hearing before the Committee on Foreign Relations in the US Senate, Senator John Kerry specifically noted the funding of education as a strong tool for promoting moderation (US Senate, 2007). Pakistan and its allies must value the long-term strategic impacts of supporting the development of education in FATA. The recent Kerry-Lugar bill that authorizes the release of primarily non-military aid to Pakistan is a testament to that realization. The bill includes a specific provision for “broad-based public primary and secondary education and vocational training for both boys and girls (Kerry & Lugar 2009, p. 16).” However, Pakistan must ensure that such aid makes its way to underserved and underdeveloped areas like FATA. While the need to distribute aid equitably is understandable, the situation in FATA is extremely fragile and must be addressed as soon as possible. This is important to initiate the process of building an environment that is conducive to peace and stability. The capacity of education to create an environment of moderation and stability in FATA must be viewed not only from a development perspective but also as a security imperative. Education lays the foundation for long-term security that no amount of military campaigns are capable of. This understanding of the importance of education must be backed by more than just words, especially in FATA itself.

The Pakistani government must take an active role in persuading potential contributors to the importance of developing an educational infrastructure. First of all, FATA must be integrated into the national governance system rather than exist in a semi-autonomous relationship with the state (Haider, 2009). They must also support this
argument by allocating more national funds to the development of such infrastructure in rural areas, especially in FATA. They also must engage the private sector to establish new public-private partnerships in FATA. These types of partnerships will help facilitate the development of infrastructure. There have been public-private partnerships in Pakistan that have proven to be successful. The Punjab Education Foundation is an example of such a partnership in Pakistan (Patrinos, Barrera-Osorio, & Juliana, 2009). The schools operated by the foundation are primarily funded by the government but managed by the private sector through a board of overseers (Patrinos, Barrera-Osorio, & Juliana, 2009). This allows the foundation to tap into a variety of public and private resources. The schools have strict three structural components, “vouchers, teacher training, and monetary incentives for schools to improve academic performance” (Patrinos, Barrera-Osorio, & Juliana, 2009, p. 21).” Implementing such a program for education in FATA should be seen as a strong possibility.

Financing is a basic necessity for education to have the desired impact in FATA. Without adequate funding, it will be difficult to build and maintain such an infrastructure. Furthermore, funding is essential to make it possible for the people of FATA to actually attend school by eliminating fees. Majority of the people will not be able afford to pay for an education and therefore it is crucial that educational services be provided without incurring any financial burden on them, especially the parents of children who need to attend school.

**Recommendation 4: Place an emphasis on female education.** Supporting female education possesses unlimited potential for the transformation of FATA. According the literacy information available on FATA, the female literacy rate stands at
3 percent in the area. As women make up about 50 percent of the population in FATA, this fact should be extremely alarming (FATA [CS], 2009). The inability of almost half of the population to have access to quality education presents serious implications for any development. The lack of education makes it hard for women to forge a strong independent identity in this largely male dominated society. “Educated girls and women are more likely to stand up for themselves and resist violence (Mortensen, 2010, p.400).”

Women can be instrumental with respect to economic progress. Increasing the amount of women with a secondary education just by 1 percent results in 0.3 percent growth in per-capita income (Herz & Sperling 2004). Clearly, female education has effects that extend just beyond the immediate area and can definitely help an economically suppressed area like FATA.

Females face significant adversity in a place like FATA where religious and cultural tradition relegate women to lowest rung of the social ladder. However, as the benefits of female education are emphasized to those that are most opposed to it, the process of improving women’s status in society can be initiated. Emphasis on female education will require an approach that addresses barriers to it at all levels. This essentially means creating an environment that is conducive to female education. The direct and indirect costs with respect to the schooling of women and young girls must also be addressed in attempts to foster such a progressive environment (UNICEF, 2004a).

Young girls and women have responsibilities within their households that might prevent them from attending school. A concerted effort must be made to appeal to families to demonstrate the importance of sending them to school. This appeal should be supported with an incentive structure that makes it attractive for families to send girls and women to
school. Take-home food rations, for example, have proved effective in boosting girls’ enrollment and attendance (Herz & Sperling, 2004). Such an incentive can help with the reluctance and hesitation of rural families to send their children to school, especially for girls.

**Recommendation 5: Develop a relevant curriculum for FATA.** The curriculum for schools in FATA must be relevant to the environment in FATA. The curriculum must anticipate the needs of the residents, especially the young children, of FATA and help them reach their potential. “Innovative approaches linking learning to students’ environments seem to open new avenues both in developed and developing countries (Atchoarena & Gasperini, 2003, p.175).” Developing a curriculum that directly relates to the students’ environment can “enhance the learning process (Atchoarena & Gasperini, 2003). This approach can exponentially increase the direct impact of the educational process in FATA. A curriculum that is designed specifically for the people and environment of FATA will help in providing relevancy to their education. “Learning is much influenced by the relationship between three distinct environments; the home, the school and the community (Atchoarena & Gasperini, 2003, p.177).” The school’s curriculum must factor in the role of the other two spheres in order to be effective. For example, due to the pastoral nature of FATA, many students are involved in managing livestock. In this regard, teachers can incorporate this activity in their lesson plans (Atchoarena & Gasperini, 2003). Facilitating a learning process that is mindful of the experiences and backgrounds of the FATA’s people can produce successful outcomes.

The course of study must also factor in the diversity of the student population. FATA has young children, working age men and women, and finally older people who
still can benefit from an education. All these groups must be considered in order for the education system to be accessible to everyone. The lack of a formal education system in FATA has of course resulted in such disparities that must be addressed when formulating a strategy for education. Addressing these disparities can prove to be a crucial move in FATA. The course of study must focus on values such as justice, tolerance, and peace. This can be accomplished through a program that involves activities and courses that give priority to these values. Ensuring that the materials that will be utilized are designed to do this is the first step. What is also important is to remove “gender bias from textbooks and learning materials (UNICEF, 2004a, p. 2).” Being conscious of the materials that are being used to teach in these schools can “increase their quality and relevance to the lives of all children (UNICEF, 2004a, p. 2).” An inclusive educational system can be an important part developing a confident graduate that is not doubtful of the importance of his/her identity. A relevant curriculum can be a source of empowerment because it can facilitate the development of a healthy identity that does not give into stereotypes and gender inequities. While the society itself may not reflect this immediately, the process of education can eventually lead the way for societal changes. This consideration is critically important for FATA due to the culture and society of the area that is heavily biased towards men and their position as leaders. Future generations must learn to work as equal partners rather than as subordinates if FATA is to emerge out of the depths underdevelopment.

**Recommendation 6: Facilitate general flexibility.** The ability to attend school is an important consideration for an area like FATA. FATA is mostly a pastoral area with limited patches of agricultural activity (FATA [CS], 2009). Many families are poor and
require the whole household to contribute so they can put food on the table (FATA, [CS], 2009). This will make it difficult for some to take the traditional route of attendance. Allowing a flexible timetable for attendance can help bridge that gap (Herz & Sperling, 2004). A flexible schedule will allow boy and girls to attend without adversely impacting the livelihood of their families. For example in Bangladesh, “the school schedule is flexible; though it runs for two hours a day, six days a week, the times are set by local parents, and the school calendar is adapted to fit local considerations such as the harvest (UNICEF, 2004a, p. 3).” Giving the people in FATA the power to set the schedule will help in providing assurances that the infrastructure is being designed for their benefit and needs rather than some alternative agenda. It is always important to remember the reluctance of the Pashtun when it comes to external or foreign influences. Such efforts can go a long way in enabling them to be comfortable with such reforms. The site of the schools is also critically important to facilitating attendance (Herz & Sperling, 2004). Constructing schools that are located close to the population centers will make remove any transportation costs that might prevent families from sending children to school. This particular recommendation has a strong possibility of being effective because the people, especially parents, can see the work of the schools in action on a daily basis. This will help in addressing any reservations that they might have.

Developing childcare programs for women, especially young mothers, who want to attend school, should also be part of the plan in FATA. Providing an education to these women will help with campaign to increase awareness of the benefits of education since they will be able to experience it firsthand. This will make it easier for them to make the decision to send their own children to school in the future (Herz & Sperling, 2004). In
this regard, education will no longer be a burden but something they want and can pursue. However, due to the constraints on resources, the element of the recommendation may need to take a backseat.

**Recommendation 7: Include specific provisions for non-traditional students in FATA in education policy.** FATA has a significant population of what could be referred to as non-traditional students (FATA [CS], 2009). These are people who are not school age children or teenagers and have no prior formal education. Creating provisions within the educational infrastructure for them is important. This demographic is especially important because they can easily be subverted my extremist ideology because of their socio-economic circumstances. By providing formal education, technical, and vocational programs specifically for non-traditional students, a big portion of the FATA population could start contributing to the formal economy. The area needs its people to induce change and this change can be sustainable if it comes from within. This provision needs to include rehabilitation and disengagement programs as well. These programs make it possible for those that have been subverted by extremism to find a society that helps them re-integrate rather than marginalize them. This process is difficult and may never quite be perfected, but it is something that must be considered given the appeal of extremism in FATA. This recommendation may not be the most feasible given the limited resources for general education. However, a consideration of such programs for non-traditional students will make the educational reform much more comprehensive.

**Recommendation 8: Guarantee the availability of qualified teachers and instructors for FATA.** The schools in FATA will require qualified teachers in order to ensure that a quality education available to the people in the area. Due the nature of the
area, this is a difficult task. An education policy for the area must emphasize the importance of internal and external partnerships. The unavailability of local teachers makes it necessary to recruit teachers from other areas of the country that have formal training and possibly certification. Furthermore, these teachers must be able to factor in the local environment. The instructors must also be sensitive to the needs of the people, especially the children of FATA. These teachers must be conscious of their capacity role models so that children have positive example to uphold (UNICEF, 2004a). For these teachers, their responsibilities will extend just beyond delivering lectures. They will have to serve in a capacity that requires them to respond to the children’s needs, especially those with a traumatic or troubled past. In an area like FATA, this could prove to be more of the norm than an exception.

This recommendation suffers from the lack of a standard procedure for certifying teachers for areas like FATA. There really is no mechanism that can ensure that the teachers being employed at schools in FATA are meeting the needs of the students and conforming to a standard set of principles. This factor needs to be part of FATA’s framework for education in order to begin the process of ensuring quality and dependable teachers in FATA. However, given the current situation in FATA, the practicality of the recommendation is rather low in terms of recruiting and compensating teachers adequately for working in such an environment.

**Recommendation 9: Directly involve the local community as equal partners.**

The local community can be one of the greatest assets to the development of an educational infrastructure in FATA. As demonstrated by Greg Mortensen’s work in the Northwest Frontier Province and other areas of Pakistan, the local community provides
instrumental support to building schools and ensuring their viability (Mortensen & Relin, 2006). In a conflict prone area like FATA, it is increasingly crucial to develop local partnerships that serve as buffers against actors who do not wish to see such developments take place. One of the most important roles the local community plays is increasing the awareness of education, its direct and indirect benefits. The local community can elevate the importance of education so that everyone perceives it as an opportunity and necessity rather than a luxury. This will help in increasing the appeal of education. Greg Mortensen worked with the local people to build schools that met the needs of the people (Mortensen & Relin, 2006). In his memoir, he specifically emphasizes the importance of building partnerships and relationships (Mortensen & Relin, 2006). The people were active participants in this process and it help give the school a sense of legitimacy that otherwise it would’ve lacked. It is important that an initiative like education have legitimacy, especially in FATA. If it lacks legitimacy, it can be easy target for extremist propaganda. If the schools are built in part by the people themselves then they cannot be portrayed as vestiges of westernization. The community can help prevent such attitudes from taking root in the community.

Another aspect of engaging the local community is reaching out to moderate religious and local leaders in FATA. Due to the influence of religion and cultural traditions, these two actors can prove to be instrumental in promoting education in these areas. They are seen a figures of authority and people look to them for advice and decision on important matters. If they can be persuaded to be advocates or supporters of education, especially female education, this can go a long way in fostering general support for these projects. Religious and local leaders are able to appeal to people at
levels that external actors cannot. Their association with efforts to build an educational infrastructure can be extremely effective respect to legitimacy. Due to the conflict prone nature of FATA, government and non-governmental organizations will require such support in order to sustain their efforts. However, the possibility remains that such partnerships and relationships might not be possible given the natural reluctance of the Pashtun to change, especially when it is perceived to be originating from a “foreign” source. This consideration is important in determining the involvement of the local community.

**Recommendation 10: Developing a monitoring and quality assurance mechanism for education in FATA.** A pragmatic policy for FATA must be formulated within the long-term context. These areas must be given the priority they deserve with respect to development. The history of negligence must be addressed with broad reforms, specifically in the educational services sector. Pakistan and its allies must continuously recognize the value of an educational policy for FATA. Developing the infrastructure is only the first step, ensuring that it is maintained can be extremely critical to its effectiveness. This will require Pakistan to strengthen “institutional capacity in planning and managing education for rural development” in FATA (Atchoarena & Gasperini, 2003, p. 54). This will require formulating policy and implementing it in a manner that keeps track of education in FATA over the long-term. The government must be ready and willing to devote the necessary resources to FATA in order to make education a possibility for the people in the area. This can only be done by having an education policy that centers on constantly assessing the situation and making the necessary changes. As mentioned before, this conflict prone region will require a dynamic approach
that must accommodate for the nature of the environment. The FATA Development
Authority that was established in 2006 is an institution that can be charged with this task. However, the development authority must first be strengthened itself in order to have the necessary means and capabilities to accomplish this task.

Continuous monitoring and ensuring quality will be difficult given the current state of governance infrastructure in FATA. There is no accountability and therefore its seems possible that such a mechanism is likely to fall by the wayside until, as noted in the first recommendation, the institutional and bureaucratic deficiencies in FATA and Pakistan in general are addressed. Creating a system of governance that is legitimate and preserves its integrity is vital to ensuring that the articulated educational reforms remain true to their purpose.

The specific recommendations for FATA in this chapter consider the barriers and opportunities with respect to education generally but specifically for the region itself. However, the fact that these recommendations have yet to be implemented at a scale that can truly determine their effectiveness, their viability can only be tested with what is known about the area. Ultimately, the verdict at the end of the day is that while education can lay the groundwork for moderation and stability, its capability to do so is dependent on a set of external considerations and factors. These considerations and factors include the political and judicial mechanisms, their integrity and the capacity of Pakistan to actually develop a cohesive and relevant framework for education in FATA. The integrity of local and state institutions is important because the state has a crucial role to play with respect to the educational reforms discussed in this chapter. In a region like FATA, local and state actors remain critical to the implementation of these reforms and their success.
At this point in time, Pakistan and FATA are far from this position. Despite this consideration and the lack of stability in FATA, as Haider (2009) articulates that reforms can be instrumental in “generating support among FATA’s people (p.16).” Given what is known about FATA’s people, this support is fundamental for reforms to take place. The support can possibly make up for some of the deficiencies of the state. However, these deficiencies do not mean that the state be completely absent from the reform process. Educational reform needs to be a priority the state for the process to start and support to materialize. The lack of education as priority is the quintessential barrier to educational reform in FATA.
Conclusion

Extremism poses a significant threat to the future of Pakistan and especially FATA. As a strategic battleground for the “war on terror,” FATA’s ability to move beyond the influence of extremism is necessary if there is any hope of salvaging a stable and secure future for the area and the region at large. Pakistan and its allies need to understand that military campaigns alone will not be enough in eliminating the threat of extremism from the area. Furthermore, as long as fundamental deficiencies within the political, judicial and socio-economic mechanisms remain, FATA will not be able to emerge out of the “dark ages.” The process to address these deficiencies needs to start at the grassroots with a focus on moderation, stability, and general human development in FATA. The crisis in FATA is not secret and the Pakistani government recognizes it as such. However, the priority of the crisis is seemingly unclear by the government of Pakistan. In order to seriously address the crisis in FATA, this area must be seen as priority not just in terms of the war on terror but as general development imperative.

In this regard, this senior project explored how education is able to initiate a process of general social, political, and judicial rehabilitation. In the course of this research, significant barriers to this strategy have emerged that either will first need to be addressed or concurrently engaged as part of the general strategy in developing an infrastructure for education in FATA. The barriers to education as a strategy in FATA are substantial but that does not necessarily mean that education cannot be effective in this region. It can be extremely effective as a strategy that positions FATA as a stable and
moderate society. However, the complicated nature of the area and the eroded governance mechanisms at the local and national level are the biggest challenges to any strategy for FATA but especially for education because it requires local and national governance mechanisms to be successful. Despite this conclusion, there is precedent that education has been able to foster large-scale socio-economic transformations in conflict prone areas. It is this understanding that positions education as an effective counterstrategy to the threat of extremism in FATA.
Bibliography


Government, Cambridge MA, Belfer Center for Science and International Affairs
Web site:
http://belfercenter.ksg.harvard.edu/files/xstandard/Student%20discussion%20paper%200901.pdf

http://www.wilsoncenter.org/topics/pubs/FinalPDF.pdf

http://www.ungei.org/resources/1612_583.html


Appendix A

Table of Selected Development Indicators for FATA

Table 1: Selected development indicators for Pakistan, NWFP and FATA (1998, 2003)*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Pakistan</th>
<th>NWFP</th>
<th>FATA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Literacy ratio (both sexes, %)</td>
<td>43.92</td>
<td>35.41</td>
<td>17.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male literacy ratio (%)</td>
<td>54.81</td>
<td>51.39</td>
<td>29.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female literacy ratio (%)</td>
<td>32.02</td>
<td>18.82</td>
<td>3.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Population per doctor AX</td>
<td>1,226</td>
<td>4,916</td>
<td>7,670</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Population per bed in health institutions</td>
<td>1,341</td>
<td>1,594</td>
<td>2,179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roads (per sq km)</td>
<td>0.26</td>
<td>0.13</td>
<td>0.17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Literacy rates according to 1998 census; all other figures for 2003.

Source: GoNWFP, 2005a; GoNWFP, 2005b; GoP, 1998a; GoP, undated (b).
Appendix B

Map of FATA
